- Published in final edited form as:
- Food Control (110), April 2020, doi:10.1016/j.foodcont.2019.107001
- 



#### **Abstract**

Activity concentration of natural radionuclides and  $137Cs$  were estimated in 28 honeys purchased from large supermarket chains in Italy. Uranium, polonium and thorium were 20 measured by alpha spectrometry,  ${}^{40}$ K and  ${}^{137}$ Cs by gamma spectrometry and  ${}^{226}$ Ra by liquid scintillation. The concentrations were  $50.6\pm 46.3$ ,  $0.023\pm 0.010$ ,  $0.019\pm 0.017$ ,  $0.27\pm 0.40$  Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> 22 for <sup>40</sup>K, <sup>238</sup>U, <sup>234</sup>U and <sup>210</sup>Po respectively. <sup>235</sup>U, <sup>228</sup>Th, <sup>232</sup>Th were consistently <0.007 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> and 23  $^{226}$ Ra <0.200 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>. <sup>137</sup>Cs was <2.1 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> in 93% of the samples. The activity of radiocesium was found to be above the minimum detectable level in only two samples and did not exceed the highest permitted level for food contributing to the overall radioactivity only slightly. The 26 effective doses attributable to  $^{210}$ Po accounts for 0.0026-5.31% of global human exposure to natural radiation. The honeys that were tested were found to be of good quality with regard to the parameters under study, confirming the general image of honey as a genuine healthy product.

**Keywords:** honeys; natural and artificial radionuclides; ingestion dose

- **1.Introduction**
- 

 For the general population ingestion of food or beverage is the main path in which radionuclides may be incorporated into the body, and thus the main source of internal dose. Any radioactivity present in the air, or more importantly in the ground and soil, can be transferred to the crops that are grown in that soil. Indeed, some naturally occurring radioactive elements find their way into our bodies. The most important radionuclides, accounting for the highest percentage of the radiation dose present in the body due to food intake, are the primordial 41 radionuclides  ${}^{40}$ K, thorium and uranium (Meli et al., 2016).

<sup>232</sup>Th and <sup>228</sup>Th are present in the Earth's crust. They enter the human body through the food chain and inhalation of the suspended dust in the air accumulating in the lungs, liver and skeletal tissues and causing radiation damage as well as biochemical and morphological changes.

45 A high percentage of the internal radiation dose is attributable to  $^{210}P_0$ , a naturally 46 occurring radionuclide of the  $^{238}$ U series with a half-life of 138.4 days. According to the United 47 Nations Scientific Committee on the Effects of Atomic Radiation (UNSCEAR), <sup>210</sup>Po is estimated to contribute about 8% of the effective dose equivalent to humans due to natural 49 radioactivity (UNSCEAR, 2000). <sup>210</sup>Po distribution in the environment depends to a large extent 50 on the other radionuclides in the decay series, namely  $^{226}$ Ra and  $^{210}$ Pb. Part of  $^{210}$ Po is deposited 51 on plants via the <sup>222</sup>Rn-daughters, mainly <sup>210</sup>Pb, through precipitation, caused by the outgassing 52 of <sup>222</sup>Rn from soils (= unsupported <sup>210</sup>Po). The second source of <sup>210</sup>Po is the decay of <sup>226</sup>Ra in the soil. Its presence in all terrestrial foodstuffs is, therefore, unavoidable (Brown et al., 2011, 54 Persson et Holm, 2011). Other anthropogenic activities that increase the levels of <sup>210</sup>Pb and <sup>210</sup>Po in plants include atmospheric deposition from industrial emissions, waste disposal, phosphate ore processing, coal-fired power plants, coal mining, metal smelting, etc.

Potassium, on the other hand, plays a key role in regulating many bodily functions such

 as digestion and heart rate as well as the water content of cells. Potassium content in the body is therefore held constant by metabolic processes (homeostatic control), although gender and age related variations have been observed. Its distribution within the body is more or less uniform.  $^{40}$ K is a single occurring natural radionuclide which has a very long [half-life](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Half-life) of 1.251×10<sup>9</sup> years. It makes up 0.012% of the total amount of potassium found in nature (Sugiyama et al., 2009) and its level in the body, like that of stable potassium is constant. In an average 70 kg human potassium content is 0.1-0.3% with a corresponding total activity ranging from 22 to 76 kBq of  $^{40}$ K (Altekin et al., 2015).

 Atmospheric nuclear weapon tests (1945-1963) and a series of nuclear accidents have contaminated the environment with artificial and biologically significant radionuclides such 68 as<sup>131</sup>I, <sup>134</sup>Cs, <sup>137</sup>Cs and <sup>90</sup>Sr. <sup>137</sup>Cs (characterized by a half life of 30.17 years) is among the most problematic of the short-to-medium-lifetime fission products because it spreads readily through the environment thanks to the high water solubility of Cs salts. It mainly contaminates leaves and flowers directly from the atmosphere but also through uptake from the soil. Organisms process 72 caesium in a very similar way to potassium (Altekin et al., 2015). <sup>90</sup>Sr is even more problematic 73 than Cs, but, due to the complexity of the methods requested for its analysis, much more 74 analyses have been performed on Cs.

 Honey, a nutritious product of global economic importance, is a naturally sweet substance produced by honeybees from the nectar of blossoms or from honeydew. The nectar or deposits are then modified and stored in honeycombs. Honeybees (Apis mellifera L.) are the main pollinating insects for numerous plants and fruit trees. Honey is one of the most complex food products, and its composition varies according to many factors including the botanical/floral origins of the plants from which the nectar is collected and the species of the bees. Honey can be considered a supersaturated solution composed of four main sugar (75-80%), fructose, glucose, 82 maltose and sucrose (Poschl et al., 2011). It has a water content of less than 20% and contains

 minerals and organic substances, including amino acids, enzymes, proteins, vitamins, organic acids, pigments and phenolics, (1%–2%) (Buldini et al., 2001).

 Honey is a popular natural product, not only for its taste and nutritional value, but also for its health benefits. Its high contents of glucose and fructose make honey one of the most digestible foods (Belitz et al., 2004) and it is commonly used as an ingredient in foodstuffs because of its sweetness, color, flavor, caramelization, and viscosity. Honey also has preservation properties due to its sugar-content.

 The European population is the world's largest consumer of honey (Vanhanen, 2011), and in light of the growing consumption of this natural food, it is of paramount importance to ensure its safety. Honey, in fact, can be contaminated by several toxic compounds, including radionuclides. Contamination can occur as a result of beekeeping practices or environmental factors (Bogdanov, 2006). Regarding environmental contamination, during their foraging flights, when honeybees collect nectar, pollen, plant resins, and water, they inadvertently come into contact with a wide array of inorganic and organic pollutants (heavy metals, radionuclides, pesticides etc.), which are often taken back to the colony. Hence, contaminants migrate through the chain air-water soil-plants-bees chain into honey and change its composition and quality. Of these contaminants, radionuclides are of particular interest because of their impact on the quality of honey as well as their potential adverse effects on human health. Hence, ensuring low concentrations of radionuclides in honey is imperative (Borawska et al., 2013), and commercially available honey must therefore be monitored closely to guarantee its quality, provenance and safety.

 Hence, the aim of this study was to perform a radiological characterization of a range of commercially available honeys, purchased from major Italian supermarket chains in order to evaluate the risk posed by natural and artificial radioactivity present in these products. For this



Sample code, N	Botanical origin	Sampling area	Humidity (% )	Sugar (Brix)	pH	Free Acidity (meq/kg)	Combined acidity (meq/kg)	Total acidity (meq/kg)
$\mathbf{1}$	wildflower	Hungary, Ukraine	17.7	80.2	3.9	23.6	3.3	26.8
$\overline{c}$	wildflower	Hungary, Italy	18.2	79.8	4.0	27.4	1.7	29.1
3	wildflower	Italy	16.2	81.6	4.6	60.9	3.0	63.9
$\overline{4}$	wildflower	Italy	19.0	79.0	4.1	33.4	4.0	39.5
5	wildflower	Hungary, Italy	18.2	79.5	4.1	28.4	1.6	29.9
$\sqrt{6}$	wildflower	Italy	17.4	80.2	4.4	19.8	3.7	23.5
$\boldsymbol{7}$	wildflower	Italy	18.6	79.1	5.1	17.2	1.7	18.8
$8\,$	wildflower	Argentina	18.7	79.0	4.2	32.9	2.2	35.0
9	wildflower	Italy	17.5	80.1	4.3	31.9	1.5	33.6
10	acacia	Hungary	18.0	80.0	4.2	10.6	2.1	12.7
11	acacia	Hungary	18.3	79.8	4.1	12.0	1.7	13.7
12	acacia	Italy	17.6	80.4	4.1	15.5	1.7	17.1
13	acacia	Hungary	17.9	79.8	4.2	13.0	1.2	14.2
14	acacia	Italy-Lunigiana	17.5	80.3	4.4	10.0	1.0	11.0
15	acacia	Serbia	17.2	80.5	4.5	9.6	$1.0\,$	10.6
16	eucalyptus	Uruguay	20.7	77.1	4.3	35.5	3.7	39.3
17	eucalyptus	Italy	17.7	80.3	4.3	27.3	2.9	30.2
18	eucalyptus	Italy	18.6	79.0	4.3	20.5	3.2	23.7
19	chesnut	Italy -Calabria	17.2	80.6	4.8	32.7	5.1	37.8
20	chesnut	Italy	17.5	80.3	5.5	14.5	2.7	17.2
21	chesnut	Italy	17.0	81.0	4.5	45.7	3.4	49.1
22	citrus	Italy	18.6	79.4	4.1	14.3	1.5	15.8
23	citrus	Italy	17.9	80.1	3.9	31.1	2.5	33.6
24	citrus	Italy	19.9	77.9	3.9	29.3	1.3	30.6
25	citrus	Italy	18.1	79.6	4.2	19.2	2.1	21.3
26	citrus	Italy	19.2	78.8	3.9	22.8	1.3	24.1
27	linden	Italy	17.9	80.0	4.9	17.3	4.0	21.3
28	forest honey	Italy	17.3	80.3	5.0	27.1	2.2	29.2
Minimum			16.2	77.1	3.9	9.6	1.0	10.6
maximum			20.7	81.6	5.5	60.9	5.1	63.9
Mean			18.1	79.8	4.3	24.4	2.4	26.9
<b>SD</b>			0.91	0.91	0.40	11.6	1.1	12.2
126								

 **Table 1** List of honey samples, sampling area, botanical origin and chemical composition (Meli et al., 2018)

*2.2. Analytical methods*

 Three different methods were used to measure the radioactive content of the honey samples: gamma spectrometry, alpha spectrometry and liquid scintillation.

 *Gamma spectrometry.* This technique is able to determine many different radionuclides directly and simultaneously without any specific pre-treatment of the sample. However, some 132 of radionuclides of interest in the present study, namely <sup>210</sup>Po, <sup>234</sup>U, <sup>230</sup>Th or <sup>232</sup>Th, are not gamma emitters or only poor ones and therefore it is difficult to measure them using gamma spectrometry.

 $^{40}$ K and  $^{137}$ Cs were assessed in honey by measuring all samples with a p-type coaxial HPGe detector by Ortec®, Model GEM-C5060P4 Profile C; it is characterized by an energy range of 3 – 3000 keV, a relative efficiency of 20% at 1.33 MeV and an energy resolution (FWHM) of 1.8 keV at 1.33 MeV, 850 eV at 122 keV and 725 eV at 5.9 keV. The detector was cooled to near liquid nitrogen temperature and it was placed in a shielded house built from low- background, 10 cm thick lead, lined with a sheet of copper (1.5 mm thick). The samples were counted for 150,000 s. Gamma spectra were analysed by Canberra®) Genie-2000 software. To 142 determine the activity concentration of  ${}^{40}$ K and  ${}^{137}$ Cs the gamma-ray energies of 1460.75 and 661.62 keV were considered respectively. For full quantitative analysis, the system was calibrated in efficiency and energy using multiradionuclides aqueous standard solution certified by the Italian National Institute of Ionizing Radiations Metrology (ENEA INMRI). The performances of the measuring system are periodically checked through the participation to international intercomparison exercices (Procorad and IAEA-Almera). 100 g of each honey sample were dissolved in bidistilled water with the aid of slight heating and the solution was then placed into a 180 ml Marinelli beaker. Taking into account that the density of the analysed matrices after dilution was around 1 (similar to the calibration solution), no correction for self-absorption was applied. The background spectra were counted under the same conditions using a container with bidistilled water.

 *Alpha spectrometry.* This radiometric technique is applied to pure alpha emitting radionuclides and involves a complex and time consuming pre-treatment of the sample to make measurement of the investigated radionuclide possible. The method includes a complete dissolution of the sample with nitric acid followed by a separation of the radionuclide by extraction chromatography or precipitation, and an electrodeposition to prepare the source for the measurement, etc. This technique requires very long preparation and source counting, however, it makes possible to perform a specific determination of activity concentration with extremely 160 low detection limits providing complete information on concentration and isotopic ratios of  $^{238}U$ ,  $161 \frac{235 \text{U}}{1}$ ,  $^{234}$ U,  $^{232}$ Th,  $^{230}$ Th and  $^{228}$ Th (Desideri et al., 2006).

 Taking these considerations into account, the following radiochemical method was employed for uranium and thorium measurement: 10 g of honey, after the addition of a known 164 activity of <sup>236</sup>U and <sup>229</sup>Th as the yield internal standards, was dissolved in 70 ml of 5M HNO<sub>3</sub>, 25 165 ml of 1M Al(NO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>3</sub> in 5 M HNO<sub>3</sub>; the solution was stirred (30<sup>o</sup>) and after 12 hours it was filtered. The solution was then passed through a chromatographic column (UTEVA Resin, Eichrom Technologies) constituted by dipentyl,pentylphosphonate (or diamyl, amylphosphonate), DAAP, supported on an inert polymer (acrylic ester) and conditioned with 5M HNO3; DAAP is a selective extractant in nitric medium for tetravalent and hexavalent actinides (Th, U, Pu, Np) (Thakkar, 2000). Thorium was eluted by 5M HCl and then uranium was eluted by 0.02 M HCl. The two elution solutions were evaporated, dried and mineralised. 172 Finally, the residues were dissolved in conc. H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> and transferred into an electrolytic cell. Uranium and thorium were electroplated from ammonium sulphate solution at pH 4.

For the determination of  $^{210}P_0$ , no preliminary chemical separation was required. The polonium source was, in fact, prepared by the spontaneous deposition of the element on silver plate after complete dissolution of the sample. The following radiochemical method was

 employed for polonium determination: 10 g of each sample was spiked with a known activity of  $^{209}$ Po as an internal standard yield and then treated several times with concentrated nitric acid and hydrogen peroxide to aid the oxidization of the organic compounds. When the solution was clear, the liquid was evaporated to dryness and the residue was dissolved in 80 ml of 1M hydrochloric acid. After the addition of 100 mg of ascorbic acid to eliminate the ferric ion 182 interference and 10 ml of 25% sodium citrate, both <sup>210</sup>Po and <sup>209</sup>Po were plated at 85-90°C and pH 1.5-2.0 continuously for 4 h onto a silver disk, placed in a syringe and immersed in the solution (Meli et al., 2014).

 For quality control, these analytical methods were tested using standard reference materials. .

 The measurements of the isotopes alpha emitters of polonium, uranium and thorium were 188 carried out using an  $\alpha$ -spectrometer equipped with a semiconductor silicon detector of surface 189 barrier type (300 mm<sup>2</sup> active surface, resolution 20 keV, 31.7±3.1% of counting efficiency, and 2 190 x 10<sup>-6</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> of the background in the region of interest (ROI)) (Canberra Industries, Inc., 800 Research Parkway, Meriden, CT 06450) and connected to a computerized multichannel analyzer. Counting times ranged from 1000 to 3000 min to achieve good counting statistics.

For uranium, thorium and polonium percentage chemical recoveries resulted respectively  $67.9\pm18.4$ ,  $77.8\pm16.4$  and  $88.1\pm9.2$  % respectively, and the minimum detectable activity concentration (MDA) for a 20 g sample was consistently around 7 mBqkg<sup>-1</sup>. A blank sample was prepared because reagents, containers and equipment could release impurities that could lead to miscalculation 

*Liquid Scintillation (LSC).* This method was employed for the measurement of <sup>226</sup>Ra. It makes use of the volatility of <sup>222</sup>Rn and the secular equilibrium between <sup>226</sup>Ra and <sup>222</sup>Rn. In fact; this radionuclide transfers completely and selectively from the aqueous solution containing  $^{226}Ra$  to an overlying immiscible organic phase containing the scintillation cocktail. 25 g of each honey 

sample was dissolved in water and evaporated at 200°C until a final volume of 10 ml was reached. This solution was then placed in a PTFE vial, and 10 ml of the scintillation cocktail Ultima Gold F was added. The closed vial was kept in dark for four weeks to achieve secular equilibrium between <sup>226</sup>Ra and its daughter <sup>222</sup>Rn. For each <sup>226</sup>Ra decay, three alpha decays (of <sup>222</sup>Rn, <sup>218</sup>Po and <sup>214</sup>Po) and two beta decays (of <sup>214</sup>Pb and <sup>214</sup>Bi) were considered. The samples were counted in the ultra low-level scintillation counter Quantulus 1220 from Perkin Elmer applying a special alpha/beta discrimination tool. By discrimination of the  $\beta$ -decays, the alpha decays of Rn,  $218$ Po and  $214$ Po were countable with an efficiency of around 240% and a low background could be achieved. In our measurements, a minimum detectable concentration of around 0.2 Bq/kg (not so good) was achieved due to the small sample amount (25g). Longer counting times (1000 minutes) and a low a-background could not overcome this limitation. In addition, for liquid scintillation as well as for alpha spectrometry, a blank sample was prepared because reagents, containers and equipment could release impurities that could lead to miscalculation (Desideri et al, 2019). 

#### *2.3. Activity concentrations and MDA calculation*

218 The activity concentration  $(Bqkg^{-1})$  of each radionuclide present in the sample was calculated from the formulas reported by IAEA (IAEA, 1989) and ISO (ISO 2018a; ISO 2018b). The total uncertainty of each measurement was calculated taking into account all the major sources of variability, particularly statistical fluctuations of counting both of the sample and of the blank (including background) and those associated to efficiency calibration and sample weighting. The minimum detectable activity (MDA) of the measurements system was done following the procedure shown in ISO 11929.

### *2.4. Statistical analyses*



- 
- 

## *2.4. Radionuclide annual intake and committed effective dose calculation*

 The annual intake of radionuclides was calculated as the product of the radionuclide activity concentration and the annual consumption rate. The following dose calculations were based on two different daily consumption rates: 5g (a teaspoon) and 25 g of honey. The annual committed effective dose was calculated for each radionuclide using the following formula:

- 
- *D= Q x C x I*

 where D is the annual committed effective dose for every radionuclide taken into account 244 ( $\mu$ Sv y<sup>-1</sup>), C is the radionuclide concentration (Bq kg<sup>-1</sup>), I is the annual consumption rate (kg y<sup>-1</sup>), 245 and Q is the conversion factor for ingestion ( $\mu Sv$  Bq<sup>-1</sup>) recommended by ICRP (2012) for infants 246 (1-2 year), children  $(7-10 \text{ years})$  and adults  $(>17)$ .

- 
- 
- 
- 
- 

#### 252 **3. Results**

#### 253 *3.1. Radionuclids concentrations*

254 Table 2 shows the measurement of alpha and gamma emitters for each sample. Each 255 activity concentration value was affected by uncertainties of 10%, 15%, 25% and 25% for  ${}^{40}$ K  $256$  <sup>210</sup>Po, <sup>238</sup>U and <sup>234</sup>U respectively.

257 For the <sup>238</sup>U series, <sup>210</sup>Po <sup>238</sup>U and <sup>234</sup>U were detectable in the all the samples; <sup>210</sup>Po 258 ranges from 0.03 to 1.62 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> (mean value  $0.27 \pm 0.40$  Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>); the mean activity 259 concentration was  $0.023 \pm 0.010$  Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> and  $0.019 \pm 0.017$  Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> for <sup>238</sup>U and <sup>234</sup>U 260 respectively.<sup>235</sup>U, <sup>232</sup>Th and <sup>228</sup>Th activity concentrations were consistently below MDA (0.007 261 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>) such as <sup>226</sup>Ra (0.200 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>).

262 Table 2 also shows the <sup>40</sup>K activity concentration. <sup>40</sup>K was detectable (above MDA) in 263 the 55% of the samples and this radionuclide was responsible for most of the activity in the 264 honeys honey. This is due to the fact that potassium, an essential element for humans and widely 265 distributed in the environment (Uwatse et al., 2015), can be easily transferred through the food 266 chain. The <sup>40</sup>K activity concentration ranged from <22 to 180 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> (mean value 50.6  $\pm$  46.3 267 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>). For the mean calculation, when activity concentration was below the MDA, the MDA 268 was considered.

269 Concentration differences between samples collected from honeys with different 270 botanical origins were calculated and the results were showed in table 3.

271 Regarding the <sup>210</sup>Po, a significant difference (P < 0.05) was found between the activity 272 concentration of this radionuclide in forest honey and its concentration in all the different kinds 273 of tested honey, excluding chesnut. No significant difference  $(P > 0.05)$  was found between <sup>210</sup>Po 274 concentration in wildflower honey and that in all the different kinds of honey excluding forest 275 honey.

 **Table 2** 278 • Activity concentration (Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>) of <sup>238</sup>U, <sup>234</sup>U, <sup>210</sup>Po, and <sup>40</sup>K in honey samples, minimum, maximum value, median, mean and relative standard deviation (SD)

- 
- 



- 
- 

# 303 **Table 3**.

304 Presence of significant (S) or not significant (NS) difference in term of radioactivity content 305 between honeys with different botanical origin (significance was accepted at  $P < 0.05$ )



310

311

313 No significant difference ( $P > 0.05$ ) was found between <sup>210</sup>Po concentration in wildflower 314 honey purchased from large supermarket chains  $(0.23 \pm 0.27)$  and the concentration in 315 wildflower honey samples produced by local beekeepers in Central Italy  $(0.40 \pm 0.46$  Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>) (Meli et al., 2016).

Regarding the <sup>40</sup>K, significant difference ( $P < 0.05$ ) was found between the concentration of this radionuclide in acacia honey and that in eucalyptus, chesnut, linden and forest honey. Significant difference was found between its concentration in eucalyptus honey and that in 320 acacia, chesnut, citrus and forest honey. No significant difference  $(P > 0.05)$  was found between  $40$ K activity concentration in wildflower honey and its concentration in all other kind of honey.

 $137<sub>Cs</sub>$  was consistently below the MDA (2.1 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>) except in samples 27 (linden) and 28 323 (forest) which showed an activity concentration of 5.14 and 4.00 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>respectively. This points to the presence of residual contamination from anthropogenic radioactivity in the analyzed samples.

 Table 4 (part A) shows a comparison between the values found in this study with those reported by other authors for Italy and other European regions. Due to variations in concentrations of natural radioisotopes in the environment, honeys of different origins are expected to contain variable levels of radioactiviy. Such variations in the content of natural radionuclides can be attributed to the botanical types of the plants from which the nectar is collected, the preferential absorbability of those plants, variability of their soils, use of fertilizers, radioactivity content of the irrigation water and the climatic conditions (Borawska et al., 2013). Furthermore, different methods of sample solubilization and different analytical techniques may also affect the results. In any case the values that were measured in this study were comparable with those found by other researchers.

**Table 4** A) Comparison of the some radionuclide activity concentration (mBqkg<sup>-1</sup>) of honey 337 produced in different regions of Italia and Europe; B) Comparison between the  ${}^{210}Po, {}^{238}U, {}^{226}Ra$ 338 mean concentration (mBqkg<sup>-1</sup>) found for honey in the present study and that reported by 339 UNSCEAR (2000) as reference value and as mean concentration in European diet (excluding





#### *3.2. Potential health hazards resulting from honey consumption*

 Quality control of honey is of great importance given the overall increasing global consumption of honey, in particular, in the European Union which is, as already mentioned, the world's largest consumer of honey. There is no specific regulation regarding the presence of radionuclides in honey. The Directive 2001/110/EC of the European Union Commission relating to honey includes some general and specific properties regarding its composition but no guidelines are provided regarding the content of radionuclides are given (European Commission, 2001). The Council Regulations EC 733/2008 and EC 1048/2009, which set the maximum levels for certain contaminants in foodstuffs, do not address apiary products (EC, 2008 and 2009). For 351 milk, its derivatives and products for children, the limits for  $137Cs$  were set at 370 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> while 352 for other foods, the limits for  $137Cs$  were set at 600 Bq kg<sup>-1</sup>. Consequently, at present, there are no 353 legal criteria with which to compare the results obtained in this study. The contents of  $137Cs$ 354 found in this investigation were <2.1 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> in 26 samples and 5.14 and 4.00 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> respectively in two samples (27, linden and 28, forest) and therefore were consistently below the limit set by European Community Regulations (EC, 2008 and 2009) and the Guideline levels established by WHO in 1995 and amended in 2010, (WHO, 1995 (2010)).

358 Table 4 (part B) shows a comparison between the  $^{210}Po^{238}U$  and  $^{226}Ra$  mean 359 concentrations (mBqkg<sup>-1</sup>) measured in honeys in this study and the corresponding values reported by UNSCEAR (2000) which serve as reference values and as mean concentrations for the European diet (excluding Italy). The results of the present investigation are comparable with the reference values and with those found in the European diet indicated by UNSCEAR.

 The final aim of our investigation of honey was to estimate the dose of radiation attributable to the consumption of honey. The contribution to the radiation dose attributable to the ingestion of natural radionuclides was calculated for three segments of the population: infants 366 (1-2 year), children (7-10 years) and adults (>17 years). In addition, two different values of daily 367 honey ingestion were considered: 5 g (a teaspoon) and 25 g.

368 Table 5 shows the <sup>210</sup>Po committed effective dose (nSv  $y^{-1}$ ) calculated for individuals 369 belonging to the three segments of the population, the minimum and maximum, the median, the 370 arithmetical mean and the relative standard deviation for every group of honey and for all 371 samples. Considering a daily honey ingestion of 5 g, the maximum contribution to the internal 372 dose (26000 nSv y<sup>-1</sup>) by <sup>210</sup>Po accounts for about 1.1% of the average annual effective dose to 373 which the world population  $(2.4 \text{ mSvy}^{-1})$  is exposed, whereas for a daily honey ingestion of 25 g, 374 that value rises to 5.3%.

375 Table 5 shows the <sup>238</sup>U and <sup>234</sup>U committed effective dose (nSv  $y^{-1}$ ) calculated for 376 individuals belonging to the three above-mentioned segments of population, the minimum and 377 maximum, the median, the arithmetical mean and the relative standard deviation for every group 378 of honey and for all samples. For a daily honey ingestion of 5 g, the maximum contributions to 379 the internal dose from <sup>238</sup>U (10.6 nSv y<sup>-1</sup>) and <sup>234</sup>U (20.8 nSvy<sup>-1</sup>) correspond respectively to 4.4  $10^{-4}\%$  and 8.7 10<sup>-4</sup>% of the natural radiation exposure in the world population, whereas, for a 381 daily honey ingestion of 25 g, these values rose to 53  $(^{238}U)$  and to 104 nSv y<sup>-1</sup>  $(^{234}U)$ 382 respectively accounting for 2.2  $10^{-3}$ % and 4.3  $10^{-3}$ % of natural radiation exposure.

383 It is quite clear that the maximum dose obtained for <sup>238</sup>U, <sup>234</sup>U and <sup>210</sup>Po should not be a 384 cause for concern even assuming the most conservative hypothesis (maximum dose value for a 385 daily consumption of 25 g of honey).

386 Table 6 shows the mean concentrations and the mean committed effective doses for all 387 radionuclides under study  $(^{238}U, ^{234}U, ^{235}U, ^{210}Po, ^{232}Th, ^{228}Th, ^{226}Ra, ^{40}K$  and  $^{137}Cs$ ) in infants, 388 children and adults assuming a daily honey ingestion of 5g and 25g.

**Table 5.** <sup>210</sup>Po, <sup>238</sup>U and <sup>234</sup>U committed effective dose (mean and relative standard deviation 390 (SD) for every group of honey in  $nSvy^{-1}$ ) from a daily honey ingestion of 5 and 25 g, calculated 391 for individuals belonging to three segments of the population (infants, children and adults) 392



**Table 6.** Radionuclide mean concentration  $(Bqkg^{-1})$ , conversion factor for ingestion, Q,  $(\mu Sv Bq^{-1})$  recommended by ICRP (2012) for three

395 segments of population (infants, children and adults), Mean Committed Effective Dose  $(\mu Svy^{-1})$  by daily honey ingestion of 5 and 25 g and comparison

- with the Committed Effective Dose from diet (UNSCEAR, 2000)
- 
- 



 $A_1$  As regards <sup>232</sup>Th, taking into account a concentration equal to the MDA value (0.007  $402$  Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>), the committed effective dose ( $\mu Sv$  y<sup>-1</sup>) calculated for individuals belonging to the three 403 above mentioned segments of the population ranges from 0.0029 to 0.0057  $\mu Svv^{-1}$  and from 404 0.0145 to 0.028  $\mu$ Svy<sup>-1</sup> for a daily honey ingestion of 5 g and 25 g respectively. These values 405 account in any case for an absolutely negligible contribution to the average annual effective dose 406 to which the world population is exposed. The same results were also obtained for  $^{228}$ Th,  $^{235}$ U 407 and <sup>226</sup>Ra. The <sup>40</sup>K dose calculated in this study for comparison purposes taking into account a 408 mean concentration of  $50.6$  Bqkg<sup>-1</sup> was also reported in table 6. Potassium is an essential element 409 under homeostatic regulation in the body and it is not influenced by variations in environmental 410 levels (Desideri et al., 2019). For <sup>40</sup>K, the committed effective dose ( $\mu Sv$  y<sup>-1</sup>) calculated for 411 individuals belonging to the three segments of the population (infants, children and adults) 412 ranged from 0.55 to 3.88 and from 2.77 to 19.4  $\mu$ Svy<sup>-1</sup> for a daily honey ingestion of 5 g and 25 413 g respectively. These mean values account for 0.0245-0.169% and 0.120-0.844% respectively of 414 the natural radiation exposure in the world. The committed effective dose trend of natural 415 radionuclides was <sup>210</sup>Po ~<sup>40</sup>K > <sup>226</sup>Ra >> <sup>238</sup>U, ~<sup>234</sup>U~<sup>232</sup>Th~<sup>228</sup>Th><sup>235</sup>U.

416 Table 6 also shows the comparison between the Committed Effective Dose of natural 417 radionuclides due to a daily honey ingestion of 5 g or 25 g and that which is due to diet reported 418 by UNSCEAR (2000) for individuals belonging to the three segments of the population under 419 study. In particular, for <sup>232</sup>Th and <sup>228</sup>Th, the dose values account for 0.8-10.8% and 0.46-6.0% 420 respectively of the dose from diet reported by UNSCEAR; for  $^{238}$ U and  $^{234}$ U, the dose values 421 account for 0.7-10.9% and 0.6-8.8% respectively; for <sup>235</sup>U the dose values account for 5-69%; 422 for <sup>226</sup>Ra and <sup>210</sup>Po, the dose values account for 1.6-23.0% and 0.84-12.0% respectively of the 423 dose from diet reported by UNSCEAR (2000).

424 As far as  ${}^{40}$ K is concerned, UNSCEAR (2000) indicates an annual effective dose from <sup>40</sup>K naturally present in our bodies of 165 and 185  $\mu$ Sv for adult and children respectively; this 426 dose value contributes to about 60% of the total exposure due to food ingestion (290  $\mu$ Sv). 427 Therefore, the detected average activities of <sup>40</sup>K in honey (50.6 $\pm$ 46.3 Bqkg<sup>-1</sup>), for the daily 428 ingestion of 5 or 25g of this food, would appear to pose only a minor risk  $(0.55-19.4 \,\mu\text{Sv y}^{-1})$  to the internal radiation of the population.

430  $\frac{137}{\text{C}}$  For  $\frac{137}{\text{C}}$ , the only artificial radionuclide that was detected, taking into account the 431 maximum concentration observed (5.14 Bq kg<sup>-1</sup>), the committed effective dose ( $\mu Sv$  y<sup>-1</sup>) calculated for individuals belonging to the three segments of the population under study (table 6) 433 ranged from 0.093 to 0.122 and from 0.470 to 0.609  $\mu$ Svy<sup>-1</sup> for a daily honey ingestion of 5 g and 25 g respectively.

 The results of the radiological characterization of the honey show that the levels of natural and artificial radioactivity were far below those assumed to be safe in food products by UNSCEAR for diet.

#### **4. Conclusion**

441 Natural radionuclides and  $137Cs$  were determined by alpha, gamma spectrometry and liquid scintillation in 28 kinds of honey widely consumed in Italy and purchased in major supermarket chains. Quality control is an important issue in regard to the rising global trends in total honey production and the fact that the European Union is the world's largest consumer of honey.

 The radionuclides that were detected in honey showed a wide range of activity. These activity levels were influenced by the area foraged by bees, by the type of flowers where the





- Buldini, PL., Cavalli, S., Mevoli, A., Sharma, Jl. (2001). Ion chromatographic and voltametric determination of heavy and transition metals in honey. *Food Chemistry* 73, 487-495.
- Desideri, D, Meli, M.., Feduzi, L, Roselli, C (2006) The importance of Radiochemistry for the characterization of NORM and of environments contaminated by NORM. *International Journal of Environmental Analytical Chemistry.* 86(8-15), 601-613
- Desideri, D., Battisti, P., Giardina,I. Roselli, C. Feduzi, L., Gorietti, D., Meli, M.A. (2019). Assessment of radioactivity in Italian baby food. *Food Chemistry*, 279, 408-415.
- Djuric, G., Popovic, D., Torovic, D., Slivka, J., Mihaljiev, Z., (1996). Natural and fallout radionuclides in different types of honey. J. Environ. Biol., 17(4), 339-343.
- EC, 2001. Council Regulation 2001/110/EC of 20 December 2001 relating to honey, Official Journal of the European Communities, Brussels, L10, 12 January 2002, p 47-52..
- EC, 2008. Council Regulation No 2008/733/EC of 15 July 2008 on the conditions governing imports of agricultural products originating in third countries following the accident at the Chernobyl nuclear power station**.** Official Journal of the European Communities, Brussels,L 201, 30 July 2008, p 1-7.
- EC, 2009. Council Regulation No. 2009/1048/EC of 23 October 2009 amending Regulation (EC)
- No 733/2008 on the conditions governing imports of agricultural products originating in third countries following the accident at the Chernobyl nuclear power station. Official Journal of the European Communities, Brussels,L 290, 7 November 2009, p 4.
- Esposito, M., Polic, P., Bartolomei, P., Benzi, V., Martellini, M., Cvetkovic, O., Damjanov, V.,
- Simic, M., Zunuc, Z., Zivancevic, B., Simic, S., Jovanovic, V. (2002). Survey of natural

- and antrhropogenic radioactivity in environmental samples from Yuguslavia. *J. Environmental Radioactivity,* 61, 271-282
- IAEA, 1989. Measurements of radionuclides in food and the environment, Technical Report series 295. IAEA, Vienna
- ICRP, 2012. Annals of the ICRP. Compendium of Dose Coefficients based on ICRP Publication
- 60. Oxford: Pergammon Press; ICRP Publication 119.
- ISO/FDIS 11929 (2010) Determination of the characteristic limits (decision threshold, detection
- limit and limit of confidence interval) for measurement of ionizing radiation Fundamentals and application.
- ISO/DIS 20042 (2018a). Measurement of radioactivity Gamma emitting radionuclides —
- Generic test method using gamma spectrometry
- ISO/DIS 22908 (2018b). Water quality Radium 226 and radium 228 Test method using liquid scintillation counting
- 508 Meli, M.A., Desideri, D., Roselli, C., Feduzi, (2014). Assessment of <sup>210</sup>Po in Italian diet. *Food Chemistry*, 155, 87-90.
- Meli, M.A., Desideri, D., Roselli, C., Feduzi, L., and Benedetti, C., (2016). Radioactivity in honey of the central Italy. *Food Chemistry*, 202, 349-355.
- Meli, M.A., Fagiolino, I., Desideri, D., Roselli, C. (2018). Essential and toxic elements in honeys consumed in Italy. *Journal of Toxicology and Environmental Health, Part A*.. 81(21),
- 1123-1134.
- Persson, B., and Holm, E., (2011). Polonium-210 and lead-210 in the terrestrial environment: a historical review, *Journal of Environmental Radioactivity*, 102, 420-429.
- Poschl, M., Pridal, A., Duchova, I, (2011). Radioactivity of honeybee honey in the Czech Republic. *Analele Universitatii din Craiova, seia agricultura-Montanologie-Cadastru*,
- XLI/2, 225-230.
- Sugiyama, H., Terada, H., Isomura, K., Iijima, I., Kobayashi, J. and Kitamura, K., (2009).
- 521 Internal exposure to <sup>210</sup>Po and <sup>40</sup>K from ingestion of cooked daily foodstuffs for adults in Japanese cities, *The Journal of Toxicological Sciences* 34/4, 417-425.
- Thakkar, A (2000). Rapid sequential separation of actinides using Eichrom's extraction chromatographic material. *Journal of Radioanalytical and Nuclear Chemistry*, 248(2),
- 453-456
- UNSCEAR, United Nations Scientific Committee on the Effects of Atomic Radiation, Ionizing (2000). Sources and effects of ionizing radiation., New York. Report to the General Assembly with Annex, 2000.
- Uwatse, O.B., Olatunji, M.A., Khandaker, M.U., Amin, Y.M., Bradley, D.A., Alkhorayef, M., Alzimami, K., (2015). Measurement of natural and artificial radioactivity in infant powdered milk and estimation of the corresponding annual effective dose,). *Environmental Engineering Science*, 32/10, 838-845.
- Vanhanen, LP, Emmertz, A, Savage, GP (2011). Mineral analysis of mono-floral New Zealand honey. *Food Chemistry* 128(1), 236-240.
- WHO, 1995 (2010) Guideline levels for radionuclides in food contaminated following a nuclear or radiological emergency for use in international trade. Extract (pag 33-37) from the Codex general standard for contaminants and toxins in food and feed- GSCTFF (Codex
- STAN 193-1995). Adopted 1995; Revised 1997, 2006, 2008, 2009; amended 2010.